

CITY OF ROCKY RIVER

April 20, 2026

The Committee-of-the-Whole Meeting of Council was called to order by Mr. Shipp, President of Council, beginning at 7:00 p.m. in the David J. Cook Council Chambers.

Council Members Present: Mrs. Gallagher, Mr. Moran, Mr. Shipp, Ms. Havemann, Mr. Hunt, Mr. Furry & Ms. Morris

Administration: Mayor Bobst, Mr. Snyder, Mr. O'Shea

The meeting was opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by swearing in of Patrol Officer Jonathan B. Bugara to Sergeant.

Chief Lichman thanked family, friends, and colleagues for joining them this evening to show support for Patrol Officer Bugara as he takes the next step in his career. He advised that Officer Bugara has been a natural leader on the road. Additionally, Chief would watch body camera videos of him leading his teammates and people on traffic stops and other calls for service. He's not surprised by this large turnout for the oath of office, and he knows he is going to do well as a supervisor. Officer Bugara fits in well with the SWAT team and became a team leader and he is sure he will continue as a Sergeant. He added that he believes that the move from Patrol Officer to Sergeant is one of the most difficult transitions as these individuals become a supervisor to the people that they've worked as peers for many years. It can be difficult to hold your friends and peers responsible, especially when you want to maintain a friendship. He hopes everyone can make this an easy transition as Sergeant Bugara will be looking out for everyone involved.

- Mayor Bobst thanked everyone for their attendance this evening and thanked Council for all their work to ensure the Police Department has the resources needed to do their jobs. She advised that Cleveland Magazine asked Rocky River to be one of the communities featured in a special insert and their talks about the safety of our community and how successful that is to building and maintaining a successful community.
- Mayor Bobst proceeded to swear in Patrol Officer Jonathan B. Bugara to Sergeant.
- Sergeant Bugara thanked his family and everyone at the department for coming tonight. He remarked that he couldn't have done this without everyone. He thanked Sergeant Rodriguez without whom he wouldn't be here tonight, his SWAT bros and fellow patrolman.

MAYOR'S REPORT:

Mayor Bobst noted that she has one change to the minutes from April 14, 2026. She misquoted when she advised that The University Hospital's Harrington Heart and Vascular Institute was a \$15 Million it's actually a \$5.4 Million investment. Last week, she referenced the Government Finance Officers Association (GFO) award that was given to the Finance Department and this week she wanted to share something that was received from The State Auditor's Office regarding the financial health indicators that they evaluate to advise how well they are doing in terms of financial health. There are 17 separate indicators, and Rocky River received the highest possible grade or level on all 17. It's everything from debt vs. revenue, restricted funds vs. unrestricted funds, the health of the general fund, property tax, income tax, etc. If anyone would like to see that 2024 report, she'd be happy to send it along. Director Lindow is committed to retaining the same level of excellence.

Mayor Bobst advised that she understands that there is a fair amount of chatter on social media about the construction projects. As she mentioned last week, these are not just Rocky River's projects they belong to other entities as well – like ODOT and the Utilities. Director Snyder put together an explanation of what is going on with Center Ridge which he will share. She applauded Director Snyder and those people working on these projects. The asphalt that is being used was tested three times and it failed – it did not meet ODOT specifications which is an extremely important process. On Hillard several years ago, the County came in and did that project, and those specifications were not necessarily honored, and the road fell apart and at one point was held together with crack sealing. It's very important to do this testing and make sure they have a great final product. She knows people get frustrated and it does take time. It is a construction site, and they can't take that away – she hopes that residents can find a good North/South Connector between Hillard and Center Ridge or Detroit if they want to avoid the construction area.

- Director Snyder advised that they're to a point with the project where the immediate course is mostly down of asphalt, so the contractor is making concrete repairs, catch basins, and manholes. Once all that work is complete, they will come back and flip the traffic over to the middle two lanes so there will be one lane in either direction and on the center lane and they will be installing the boulevards in the center by Giant Eagle and Goldwood School. They will also be adding the signal at Goldwood, which is part of our improvement there for safety. It's a tough thing and makes for a difficult trip, but it will be impactful when completed and they appreciate everyone's patience along the way.
- Mayor Bobst added that regardless of the issue with the asphalt other work is being done including all the things that Director Snyder outlined. At the end of the day, none of them want a substandard product and the city will do everything they can to move it along as quickly as possible.
- Director Snyder advised that the email he sent to Council earlier this evening will be going out on the website and on social media updating everyone about the public projects.

Mayor Bobst requested that Director Snyder provide an update about refuse. Director Snyder advised that he knows there have been some constant frustrations when it comes to the recycling process. The City has changed its processes significantly over the last 10 years and how recycling is handled. A lot of that is due to what is accepted by the material recovery facility which is driven by industry and what they want. A few years ago, the cost of recycling went up significantly, the city used to get money for it and they no longer do. As of today, the charge is \$107 per ton to recycle and \$53.30 per ton for refuse. If they take a load to the material recovery facility in Oberlin and their sample is deemed contaminated whether that's with dirty things, bottles that aren't clean, or incorrect items there is a penalty of \$75. So, it goes from \$107 to \$182 a ton. Because of that their crews scrutinize the bags significantly. They have trained all their crew leaders, who you see driving the refuse packers, by Solid Waste District on recycling. Their current process involves their refuse scooters collecting the blue bags with the refuse. The refuse scooters have been advised not to review those because there is a lot of fluctuations as to who runs those scooters. The scrutinization is done by crew leaders. The Scooters take the blue bags back to the packer to dump and at that point that crew leader evaluates the blue bags. If there is contamination in a bag, then it goes into the refuse to manage cost. The good blue bags are left on the tree lawn to be picked up by the recycling truck. They've had instances when residents reach out to them insisting that they know they've recycled correctly. Whenever that is the case, they would request that those residents reach out directly – their goal is to educate first. It's a difficult thing; the crew leaders are tasked with throwing a blue bag in the refuse if it has something as simple as a plastic fork. We don't get to be the ones that say it's contaminated or not – it's highly subjective. They are trying to do their part because they do not want to charge residents \$182 a ton for contaminated recyclable waste. A video was sent around to Council regarding a specific instance today. Director Snyder spoke with the Service Department today and the lead supervisor and they counseled that individual. It was a tough video to

watch because it looked like they were willy nilly throwing it into the back. There as more to it that that – the video didn't encompass everything. It does however demonstrate how important it is for their refuse individuals to be very cognizant that at any point they must be doing their job as best they can. He remarked that he would have loved for the homeowner to have gone out and talked to the refuse employee and asked him to explain his process to them. Their staff are always happy to do that. They are in a very difficult position when it comes to the cost of recycling. Our current process dictates the use of blue bags. They've considered other options – he doesn't know the right answer, but he believes that they do the best they can, and he thinks they've got a system that is probably as good as they can be right now. They can always do better. The refuse scooters just keep getting larger and the staff pick up bags 400-600 times a day. Their current process is difficult, but he will continue to mentor the staff and make sure they're trained in the changes that they get from the Solid Waste District and make sure they've got a good process in place.

- Mayor Bobst noted that the changes also come through Republic which is why some communities can recycle certain things and Rocky River cannot.
- Director Snyder added that they typically get their updates through Solid Waste for example most recently clam shell recycling changed. It's a moving target as new industry accepts different types of plastic.
- Mayor Bobst advised that a few months ago there was a woman talking about sustainability at the Chamber of Commerce meeting and the questions came up about recycling. It was one of the best conversations she's had in the community about recycling and what has created the situation that we're in today. There are simply no markets for these recyclables, which is why it costs twice the amount of money to recycle as it costs to throw it in the landfill. They would welcome a lengthier conversation with Council about what they see the future being. What it means if they were to privatize which they wouldn't do without taking it to the ballot. Any change that dramatic would need to go to the voters. She hears both sides from residents about recycling options. She noted that right now they are not being hit with those \$75 surcharges because they are watching it closely. It's a much bigger issue that they'd love to talk more about and what the future looks like for their community.
- Director Snyder advised that annually they get their recycling reports from the Solid Waste District and Rocky River used to be one of the highest volume communities for curbside recycling and that's way down. They used to have a packer go to the material facility every other day and now they're once a week or every two weeks because the volume is way down, but also the fees are down. Early on when they started that fee for contaminated loads, they were paying a significant amount in penalties on a weekly basis.
- Mayor Bobst stressed the importance as country that we need to buy less, reuse, use less, and upcycle more.
- Director Snyder stated that they've been considering other means to determine if the best system is pickup by the garage because the first thing the center does is rip open the blue bags and toss them. Obviously, they cannot feasibility have two separate scooters for refuse and one for recycling. What they don't want is a bunch of lose stuff flying all over the place. He advised that this was last discussed in 2012 and the community is very different now. As he drives around, he sees that a lot of things are already brought down to the street and maybe that's a reasonable compromise. Over the last few years, they've had a significant number of instances where they've hit houses or cars. They are doing their best, but these are large vehicles plus they've had a lot of refuse staff that have had injuries due to all these lifting.
- Ms. Morris inquired if they outsourced trash and recycling would they be dinged for contaminants?
- Mayor Bobst replied that they would not, but those fees would build it into the per household per month charge.

- Director Snyder advised that those companies plan for 25-30% contamination in those green bins.
- Ms. Morris inquired if they were still recycling those loads.
- Mayor Bobst advised that it depends on the company noting that there is a lot of competition in the marketplace – Waste Management, Rumpke, Kimball, and Republic. Rocky River is one of the last few communities that picks up their own refuse. There is a lot to this – they did some really good work in 2012. Mayor Bobst confirmed that this item is not set to go to the ballot and they will continue to work with The Green Team on this item before anything were to change.

Mayor Bobst advised that the valuation of the UH Urgent Care Facility is estimated to be \$1.25 Million and the UH Harrington Center is \$5.4 Million and Akron Children is \$30 million.

Mayor Bobst advised that Rocky River Park and Bradstreet Landing are getting their AED machines.

Mayor Bobst remarked that the Summer of Fun events are up on the city website and as things are added it will be modified.

Mayor Bobst advised that tomorrow, Tuesday April 21st, is the public meeting for the Hillard/Gasser/I-90/Westway meeting in Council chambers at 6:30 pm.

Mayor Bobst advised that Friday April 24th is the Arbor Day Tree plating at 10:00 am between Hilliard and just east of safety town.

Mayor Bobst shared that Friday evening she'll be attending The College Club West 100th anniversary and on behalf of Council and the Administration she'll be presenting a proclamation honoring their service to the community and to one another.

Mayor Bobst advised that April 30th is the State of the City Address. The tradition has been that it's been given at the Chamber of Commerce Luncheon which begins at 11:30 am. There are lots of great things going on to share. If they're able to attend, she knows the chamber would love to have them.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

Ordinance No. 52-25: Mr. Hunt advised that there is no new information on 52-25.

Ordinance No. 54-25: Mr. Hunt advised that he hopes he and Mr. O'Shea can get together to get the wording on the exhibit finalized this week.

Ordinance No. 17-26: Mr. Shipp advised that 17-26 is an emergency ordinance authorizing the Mayor and the Director of Public Safety-Service to enter into a contract with Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc. for the Wagar Road Resurfacing Project at a Cost Not to Exceed \$714,525.05. This project will include portions of Wager Rd between Hillard Blvd and Detroit and it will also include Westway between Wagar and the Bridge as you head westbound. There will be full-deep concrete repairs, curb repairs, ADA Compliant curb ramps and crosswalk improvements. He noted that \$250,000 of this project will be paid for by Cuyahoga County Public works 50/50 program. He advised that there were six bids received. The estimate was \$1,026,000 and all six of the bids came in under that estimate with Crossroads Asphalt Recycling being the lowest bid and the one recommended by Ms. Kerber. Crossroads has done work in Rocky River in '22, '24, '25 as part of the Street Repair Program and they completed similar projects in the cities of Oberlin, Olmsted Falls and Berea. They've received favorable recommendations from other cities

and Crossroads has no unresolved findings in the Auditor of State database. He recommended starting a consent agenda and adding this item to that for their next Legislative Meeting.

Ordinance No. 18-26: Ms. Havemann advised that 18-26 is amending Section 731. The existing section governs outdoor sales for brick-and-mortar buildings, and the additional section 731.05 will be for outdoor sales less than three days such as farmers markets and other outdoor sales. They'll be revising the existing ordinance and adding that new section. She suggested adding it to the consent agenda.

Ordinance No. 20-26: Ms. Gallagher advised that 20-26 authorizes the purchase of (1) 2024 Ford F550 Utility Body Truck from Mike Bass Ford because it's available now and it will not cost more than \$85,200.00. She advised that it will be replacing a 2008 Ford Van with 81,000 miles. It's the most cost effective and practical choice according to Director Snyder. This vehicle is still under warranty coverage consisting of 3 years or 36,000 miles, bumper to bumper, 5 years or 60,000 miles on the powertrain and safety restraint systems, 5 years of corrosion protection, and 5 years or 100,000 miles on the engine. Lastly the truck is available now whereas there would be a delay for the 2026 model. She suggested adding it to the consent agenda.

Ordinance No. 21-26: Mr. Furry advised that Ordinance 21-26 is amending Chapter 133 of the Codified Ordinances which pertains to the Finance Department. 133.09 is a new section as our code previously only went to 133.08. This allows the city to collect \$25 to any payment made to the City of Rocky River that is returned or dishonored for any reason including, but not limited to, non-sufficient funds, stop payment or closed accounts. He added that the City is charged for these, so we are just trying to recoup some of those funds. He suggested adding this item to the consent agenda as well.

Ordinance No. 22-26: Ms. Morris advised that this ordinance would award the Recreation's Strategic Plan contract to BerryDunn in the amount of \$249,597. This strategic plan will include community and stakeholder engagement, facility and operational assessments, financial analysis and cost recovery strategies, and development of a prioritized implementation roadmap. BerryDunn was recommended based on proven expertise with a strong emphasis on operational efficiency, financial sustainability, and cost recovery. Familiarity with regional markets through Northeast Ohio-based subcontractors. Highest overall evaluation scoring and the most tailored approach to Rocky River. She noted that she sent along the comp list of communities that that BerryDunns has worked with that were the same size as Rocky River and there were quite a few all over the United States.

- President Shipp noted that he borrowed the Mayor's copy of the proposal and suggested that if anyone else would like to review it they could borrow her copy as well.

Ordinance No. 23-26: Mr. Hunt advised that 23-26 was read for the first time last week. They also passed 15-26 last week regarding the composition of the police department and this is the companion piece that would amend the composition for the fire department in section 141.01. As Chief Lenart commented in his cover letter the fire department has seen a steady increase in emergency call volumes, resources have been stretched thinner each year as the demand for services increase, and this proposal legislation would allow the fire department to add four personnel to the ranks of the fire department and is controlled by appropriations.

Ordinance No. 24-26: Ms. Gallager advised that 24-26 authorizes the purchase for the streets division of a 240VT Four Ton Split Drum Vibratory Roller from Basic Equipment which is the sole source provider located in Eatonton, GA. We are receiving a 5% discount consistent with the typically Sourcewell cooperative purchasing rate. This will be purchased from the equipment fund and used daily by the street crews for pothole repairs, utility cut restoration, and asphalt patching. The 240VT has a built-in toe package which will enable the unit to be transported behind a truck, eliminating the need for a separate trailer. It also

provides increased mobility in confined spaces, allowing the operators to make sharp turns without damaging fresh asphalt. The 240VT is similar to our current Leeboy 4T roller previously used by the street department for over 20 years, which will mean minimal operator training and a smooth transition. She noted the limited warranty requires that it be sent in within 5 business days.

- Mr. Furry requested photographs of the new roller and inquired if delivery was included in the cost.
- Director Snyder apologized for not sending it last week. He advised he would send photographs and confirmed that the delivery fee is built in the cost.

Ordinance No. 25-26: Mr. Furry advised that 25-26 is to authorize payment to The City of Cleveland Division of Water for the annual water readings that they apply to the City Sewer fees. They choose to do this annually as opposed to quarterly to save money as they do estimates three times a year and then true up with the annual water meter readings. Technically this is underneath what is needed for council approval, but historically they have had water line project reimbursements and plus it's another governmental entity, so they chose to fully disclose. They are currently charged \$4.65 per account, which has been the same for the last three years and previously it was \$4.44 an account.

NEW BUSINESS:

Ordinance No. 26-26: President Shipp advised that 26-26 is seeking to have the Mayor and Director of Safety Public Service enter a Contract with V3 Construction Group, Ltd., For the Spencer Creek Rehabilitation Project at a Cost Not to Exceed \$1,017,539.00. They have previously seen other legislation related to this Spencer Creek Rehab project. The \$1,017,539 amount includes a contingency amount of \$150,000 and the acceptance of Alternate 1 for restoration planting on the east bank of Spencer Creek and Alternate 2 to utilize natural boulders within the stream in lieu of limestone blocks for habitat enhancement. A total of four bids were received on March 20, 2026. The bid results, including Alternates 1 and 2, were open and listed. The engineer's estimate was a little over \$1.5 million, and all of the bids were under that. The initial apparent low bidder was Shoreline Contractor, but they were determined to be non-responsive and was not accepted, as the contractor failed to provide the complete bid documentation required by the specifications consistent with Section 2.105 of the bid documents. The bid processes and the results were scrutinized and carefully reviewed to ensure we had a fair and transparent bid process and following that review V3 Construction Group is recommended as the lowest and best bidder. They can talk more in the coming weeks about reference checks, but V3 Construction group has done similar projects in other cities in Ohio. They have good working relationships with the stakeholders and work on schedule. There were no findings for recovery with the Auditor of State. The project is supported in part by outside funding, including \$300,000 from the United States EPA through Section 319 funding and \$196,000 in Ohio State Capital Funding from House Bill 2. These combined grant funds total \$496,000 which is about 51% of the total project cost. The purpose of this project is to stabilize the Spencer Creek streambank, reduce erosion, and restore both shoreline and in-stream habitat. The work generally consists of shoreline toe protection, installation of rock cross-vane flow control structures, floodplain bench grading, retaining wall construction, invasive species removal, restoration planting, and the installation of in-stream habitat features. In addition to the ecological and infrastructure benefits, the project will significantly improve visitor access and usability of Bradstreet's Landing. Stabilization of the streambank and shoreline will create safer and more durable access points to the creek. He noted that the slides for the public meeting have been provided via email to Council.

- Mr. Furry stated that Shoreline was nonresponsive, is that because they wanted to clarify the 2.105 bid and they never got back to us?
- Director Snyder advised that 2.105 requires the contractor to submit the entire bid document. The reason they require that is because it doubles as their contract. Our past practice is that the entire bid document must be submitted with the bid because that's our proof that the contractor has

everything in its entirety and agrees to every portion of the contract. Shoreline did not do that. They only submitted the bid sheets and that was the only thing they submitted. In a perfect world we could go with that, but in past practice we stick to our rules and the rules state very clearly what is needed and that is why their bid was thrown out.

- Mr. Furry noted that the other thing he noticed was that the engineers' bid was 50% off. He knows they probably get some latitude, but this seems to be a significant difference.
- Director Snyder advised that, if they recall, they did remove the trees ahead of time which reduced the bids and was included in the engineers Estimate. Additionally, there was quite a bit of fluctuation in stone costs over the past few years for projects like this and we didn't know where the stone pricing would fall and that's a significant portion of this. Lastly, there is a significant portion that is site work. He agrees it's high and he thinks the engineer was liberal to make sure they fell within that because there were some uncertainties.
- Mayor Bobst clarified that it was SmithGroup that created that estimate not their local engineer.

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS:

President Shipp reminded Council that the Charter Review commission is meeting Wednesdays at 6:00 pm and this Wednesday they are looking at Titles 2 and 3 dealing with the Mayor and Council. Council is invited to attend to provide their viewpoint or answer any questions.

President Shipp thanked the Mayor and Director Snyder for addressing the email concerns that he received from constituent Mr. Clayton Ledford regarding the recycling concerns.

COMMITTEE REPORT:

Ms. Havemann advised that at the Board of Zoning and Appeals meeting this week a resident on Lake Rd. wanted to put in a circular driveway and the current rule requires that the lot be 90' wide to allow this and his lot was 65'. The BZA Board and Assistant Law Director Dever were concerned that it may be setting a precedent if they approve a circular drive because then everyone might start asking for circular drives. Director Dever mentioned *Duncan v. Middlefield* which the Supreme Court ruled upon which provided guidance for variances. One of the things they're supposed to consider is if the essential character of the neighborhood be substantially altered or will adjoining properties suffer a substantial detriment as a result of the variance. They were hoping Council could give them some guidance and opinion on how they feel about how strict they should be about the circular driveways. Safety was brought up as a justification for the driveway, and they also discussed potentially lowering the speed on Lake rd. which would require traffic study. They considered that perhaps they could extrapolate the traffic study used for a different project.

- Mayor Bobst advised that from the Lakewood line to close to Wagar is 25 mph and then at some point it does increase because it's a state route. She advised that she will speak with him, but the Chairman of the BZA needs to formally request City Council opinion in writing.
- Ms. Havemann advised that they did end up approving the driveway after much discussion, but they were curious what Council would think about it. She remarked that most of the driveways along that stretch are not 90' wide.
- Mayor Bobst stated that she does understand the issues backing up into Lake Rd she will get with the Chair of BZA.

Council, Mayor Bobst, and Director O'Shea continued to discuss the parking limitations, curb cuts, concrete, and the protocol that BZA should formally request council review in writing of the 90' requirement.

- Director O’Shea advised that their Charter was amended to allow BZA to autonomously make decisions so they can send them a message, but there is nothing that the Administration can do about it.
- Mayor Bobst clarified that since Council sets the laws, she believes that perhaps BZA was suggesting Council discuss the building code to potentially change the requirement from 90’.
- Mr. Hunt noted that they’ve already set precedent if they’ve granted the variance.
- Mayor Bobst remarked that they look at each request individually.

Ms. Morris advised that Parks and Recs met last week and the indoor pool will be closing on May 17th. Additionally, they are raising prices on the birthday parties which haven’t been raised since 2019. An indoor pool party is going up from \$180 to \$300. The ice rink rental is going from \$180 to \$250. The outdoor pool parties will be \$300 during the day and \$600 at night for up to 100 people all the other parties are 30 people maximum. The rate increases is because expenses, including paying lifeguards, have gone up. They’ve been discussing kids riding bikes and motorbikes and not wearing helmets. A suggestion was made at the parks and recs meeting to require bike licensing, which is apparently something that was one in the past. They would consider this a tool for education, especially with motorized vehicles. Perhaps it may not even cost anything except the cost of the sticker and maybe green team could help with that. They see this as an opportunity to require helmets and show kids how to correctly wear helmet. She advised it’s just something for Council to think about.

- Mayor Bobst advised that they used to have a Bike week which was an incredible event that included bike safety, training, how to wear a helmet, and a bike raffle. She advised that she likes the idea of licensing. She plans to speak to the Chief as some other committees have passed legislation about eBikes. She’ll work with the Chief to get something before Council.

President Shipp reminded Council of the public meeting on tomorrow and advised that he will be in attendance. The next meeting will be a Legislative Meeting on April 27, 2026. As there was no further business, President Shipp adjourned the meeting at 8:07 p.m.

Paul Shipp
President of Council

Lauren Oley
Clerk of Council