

CITY OF ROCKY RIVER

DECEMBER 6, 2019

Finance Committee

The meeting of the Finance Committee was called to order by Mr. O'Donnell, Chairman of the Finance Committee, at 8:00 a.m. in the David J. Cook Council Chambers.

Finance Committee Members Present: Mr. O'Donnell, Mr. Moran, Mr. Hunt,
Mr. Shepherd

Council Members Present: Mr. Furry, Mr. Klym, Mr. Sindelar

Administration: Mayor Bobst, Mr. Thomas, Director Costello, Director Holub,
Chief Stillman, Chief Lenart, Director Huff, Superintendent McConnell

Also present: Judge Fitzsimmons, Clerk Comery, Commissioner Snyder

The meeting was opened with the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mr. O'Donnell opened the meeting by saying thank you to everyone for attending this morning's meeting. Mr. O'Donnell also thanked the administration and Council for all their hard work for not only what is happening today but also all the hard work leading up to this point giving Council the opportunity to review each department and having a productive meeting. Every time Council discusses Ordinance No. 94-19, Mr. O'Donnell comments that this is one of the most important ordinances discussed each year. Council appreciates the Director's time in meeting this morning to discuss the important matters going on in each department, the financial condition and the anticipated needs of 2020. Mr. O'Donnell said that the 2020 Budget is really just the framework to work from in 2020. It would be impossible to create a budget that would account for everything that will happen in 2020. It is important to remember that this is just an outline and Council will need to remain flexible to make adjustments through 2020. Mr. O'Donnell circulated a brief overview of some of the major activity in 2020. The Police Department is one of the most significant project going in in 2020 and deal with the debt and paying for that going forward into 2020; \$1,000,000 in the budget for Bradstreet's Landing although that project has not been finalized; the ladder truck and the Budget Stabilization Fund which is projected to have a significant balance by the end of 2020 at approximately \$1,000,000. Mr. O'Donnell corrected the projected 2020 revenue shown on his report to \$22,000,000. The \$15,750,000 shown on his report is Income Tax only.

Mayor Bobst said how much the administration and directors appreciate Council's engagement in this process. The Mayor has conversations with other Mayors and Rocky River is very fortunate to have this level of engagement and level of understanding regarding the budget. The administration thanks Council for being their partners in this process. Mr. O'Donnell framed it

well by stating this is where we start, prepare the budget on the revenue side very conservatively and on the appropriation/expenditure side, the administration tries to anticipate all the needs of the coming year and balance it all out. The fund balances are very important. They are strong and continue to grow. The Mayor and Director Thomas are very mindful of the strong fund balances because of Moody's Rating. Flexibility is key and extremely important having a diversity of revenue sources, etc. The revenue projection for the General Fund is just north of \$22,000,000 with income tax being the \$15,750,000. This is a conservative projection. The city is over its projection already with one more distribution that will be close to a \$1,000,000 with income tax, but keeping at a conservative approach. The total valuation of the community is at an all-time high at \$884,539,000. Director Thomas will make an adjustment in the budget because it was based on a lower valuation. This ties in with the millage, in general terms at \$884,000,000 one mill would be \$884,000. Director Thomas will be working on the final calculation regarding the new information just received.

The city is always looking at Building Department, Recreation Department and Senior Service fees to be sure the fees are appropriate in covering costs yet still competitive in providing programming and services that residents expect and enjoy. Some Building Department fees are currently in front of Council.

Yesterday the Mayor had an opportunity to thank the Governor for the Local Government Fund and the Fuel Tax Sharing where local communities now receive a larger percentage of that tax. The city will receive about \$1.1 million in 2020 and 2021, which is an increase of about \$420,000 a year. That is very meaningful to the city.

The stability and diversity within the employers and property owners of Rocky River is extremely good and that continues. The city continues to monitor this and there have been no major shifts or businesses moving out.

The Mayor said that the budget looks different with more detail because of Munis. Munis has enabled the Finance Department to be more detailed and more precise with line items. Council can still compare last year's budget to this year's budget to easily see increases or decreases.

On the expenditure side there is a 2.5% salary increase across the board for all employees. The Charter Review Commission will also be seated in 2020 at the cost of \$8300. There are nine Charter Review Members and a secretary who is compensated.

This year is the final year of the Beachcliff Lease. This was the only incentive the city has ever provided to a local business or property owner, but the city needed more parking and it made sense to collaborate with Beachcliff. The total expenditure when it started was \$980,000 that has been paid out over several years. It was frontloaded first with a quarter of a million dollars and then \$200,000 dollars and then the smaller payments.

Capital will be discussed in a lot of detail and that makes up the biggest part of the budget. The Mayor loves this process and it is an important part of the work that the city does because it sets the priorities and the focus for the next year. The Mayor thanked the Directors for their great job and thanked Council for their engagement.

President Moran said that he and Councilman Hunt witnessed this process years ago when it was initiated in December/January and pushing through to have it done by March/April. Since Mayor Bobst has taken over, this whole process has been done as it should be. Having a road map for the year in front of Council and the administration shows everyone what to expect. Hats off to the Mayor and all the Directors for preparing this and being ready to share with Council in 2019.

- Councilman Klym asked how Munis is going and would like to suggest that Director Grau be included in the Budget Hearing in the future. The Mayor had made a note to include Director Grau in future meetings. The next phase for Munis will be for the Building Department. There have been a couple issues with the Munis support that needs cleared up, but feel confident it will be taken care of. Two personnel left Munis at the end of the project. The city is live and working it. Director Thomas stated that the Finance Department loves the software. Everything the Finance Department did on paper is now an electronic process. Director Thomas met with Recreation this week about doing a budget transfer, which was emails, confirming by email and setting up a spreadsheet and initiating a journal entry right from the desk of all the users. There was onsite training so all the information and capability of the system is in all the departments. Paperwork is being scanned in at the department level for review in the remainder of the payment process through Director Costello, Mayor Bobst and Director Thomas' office. It has taken over the manual processes the city had. Director Thomas stated that the launch was rough, but it is working out. Some capabilities were added and that took some adjustments. Council saw the operating units set up in recreation and several in the police department. It will be up to the departments to decide what will be used. The city has paid for the phase that has been implemented and the next component will be HCM, Human Capital Management and Intergov. There are pricing commitments from Munis, but the processes have not been initiated so there has not been any billing for that. The Mayor stated it will be about a quarter of a million dollars. Mr. Klym asked if there would be an ordinance this year and the Mayor confirmed that there will be an ordinance. The Mayor said that the Auditors love the Munis system making the audit much easier with the actual invoice attached to the expenditure. The training and support needs to go seemingly at the next roll out. The Mayor is very excited about adding the Building Department because that really expands the capabilities and the service for the residents and contractors. The plan is to roll that out this year but the city has held back until the other issues are addressed.
- Councilman O'Donnell agreed to add Mr. Grau to next year's agenda especially to discuss the security piece. The Mayor offered to have Mr. Grau come to a Council meeting, possibly in January. Mr. Klym agreed. The nice thing about this process is having the Directors speak about their departments.
- Mr. Moran said that some timing factors for reports seem to be delayed. Director Thomas said there is a component of finalizing reports that have to be written as they are not stock reports and that is causing a delay. Director Thomas said that the hardware is functioning efficiently with the software. The Mayor added that Mr. Grau has done a lot with security also.

- Mr. Furry asked about Tab 5 pg. 1 - Finance Net Profits - is that a new line item. Director Thomas that is a new line item. Director Thomas can now add detail that he could not before. He took the sources of the income tax and broke it out into three accounts. The sources are:
 - Net Profits, which are the profits of businesses in town;
 - Withholding
 - Residence Tax

It is the total of these three. This will be right on the face of reports on an ongoing basis so that the revenue sources can be seen each month and how it relates to the budget.

- Mr. Furry also saw Professional Services listed and what the allocation is for that and what it entails. Director Thomas said it depends on each particular department. Those are independent contractors for the Senior Center (class instructors) and Recreation Department (game officials, program and fitness instructors) and are usually 1099 contractors. Director Thomas may add line items that says Instructors, Game Officials etc. There is capacity in the system to do that. Director Thomas added that in Finance he took out Finance Professional Services and added an Audit and Bank Fees line, which are the professional services his department undertakes.

Recreation Department

Councilman Klym introduced the budget of the Recreation Department with the assistance of Recreation Director Bob Holub. Mr. Klym spoke about staffing with 12 full-time and approximately 250 seasonal/recreational part-time employees. Personnel changes this year include David Jaratz retiring in August 2019 and was replaced by Jeff Waddell in a similar capacity but different title. Michele Eibel and Bob Holub started in June/July 2019. Dave Ford will be retiring in January 2020. Mr. Holub does not anticipate any additional full time staffing, but is looking to realign the department to generate more income, offer better services or increase services. Mr. Holub and the Mayor are looking at how to replace Mr. Ford's role and possibly realigning duties. Some of the re-organization does include a professional marketing and membership person. It would not be a new person but a current full-time employee with their focus changing over to Marketing the department. A Marketing Intern from Lorain Community College will be joining the staff to assist Jane Reich. Mr. O'Donnell asked if Mr. Ford's retirement will be replaced with someone at the same level salary range. The Mayor stated that that is yet to be determined. There will be some cost savings ultimately with the range being similar to Dave's potentially. Mr. Balla is taking on some individuals from the recreation department opening up some strategic opportunities in recreation.

Mr. Klym said that the 2019 Revenue number is down from where the revenue projection was, but it does not include the final \$100,000 of the transfer. Mr. Holub said that the change over to Munis has been awesome. Many of the numbers for revenue projections are not drastically different because adjustments can be made to be more specific and strategic on the programming goal. Department goals include a better oversight of funds at the program/operational level; increased staff responsibility of budget management and easier planning for future needs. Mr. Klym stated that going forward the budget projections will be more accurate. Mr. Holub discussed charts showing operating supply comparisons from 2019

to 2020, operating and maintenance comparisons from 2019 to 2020, part-time wage breakdown and professional services breakdown. Mr. Holub stated that his staff was very involved in the budget process as well.

There will be a minimum wage increase, integrating staff uniforms and the general fund transfer is \$450,000. Capital Budget Highlights include Fitness Equipment Replacement for \$75,000 in addition to the seven new pieces of fitness equipment approved in the last three weeks and allocated in the 2019 budget.

- Mr. Sindelar asked if there is resale value with equipment. Mr. Holub said there is a trade-in value taken off the bottom of the invoice. Mr. Holub looks at the industry standard for equipment, looking at what company gives the best value along with top of the line brands. Mr. Holub is not locked in to any specific vendor. The Mayor added that it is driven by the expectations of the members of the Civic Center. They express interest in having certain pieces/brands of equipment.

Mr. Holub will be looking at the replacement of the original track surface at the Recreation Center in the amount of \$76,000. The recreation center received an unsolicited donation from a resident in the amount of \$5,000 which will be put toward the track. The replacement should be done and completed during the August break shut-down. The kiddie slide in the natatorium will also be replaced during the August break and placed into a different location. In the Ice Arena Pavilion, there will be a chimney renovation next year along with updating of the ascetics of this area and make it operationally safe. This space is rented out frequently and the seniors use it every couple of days. There will be work done at the outdoor pool and a possible full resurface of the Linden Tennis Courts.

Mr. Holub also included a Capital Expense Plan for the next five years. In 2022 a new roof is listed for the Civic Center and in 2021 some lobby renovations. Mr. Klym appreciates this projected plan as it helps Council to look forward.

Mr. Klym also mentioned the Recreation Facebook page has been very successful.

Mr. Klym asked Mr. Holub to discuss concessions. Mr. Holub has been exploring other options and looking for the opportunity to outsource. He has met with Big Show/Cleveland Catering who manage the concessions for Westlake and Avon. He has heard a lot of positives regarding this program. The 2020 budget is built with the concessions as is. The Mayor complimented Bob as he did an evaluation of the true cost of concessions and the result was that the city is losing money on concessions.

- Mr. Sindelar asked if this company takes over the whole operation. The company will take over concessions and the current high school employees will be interviewed and have first choice on jobs.
- Mr. O'Donnell asked about the pickle ball courts at Tri-City. Mr. Holub has done some investigating and vendors have not come back with anything successful on that. He has spoken with Commissioner Snyder regarding natural structures, but not sure that will fix the issue.

Mr. Klym said that the recreation department has a component of long-term part-time employees who have not had a merit increase in a long time. Mr. Holub is looking into a new pay matrix.

- Mr. Furry looked at the financial overview and the revenue expenses in 2019 are showing large amounts. Mr. Klym said it is budgeted appropriations, but may not be spent.
- President Moran said the basic outline was taken to the next step with projecting expenses for future years. This was an excellent outline and thanked Director Holub and Councilman Klym.

Municipal Court

Mr. Moran thanked Judge Fitzsimmons and Clerk of Court Comery for attending this morning's meeting and meeting with him prior to discuss the 2020 Budget. Mr. Moran said that Council is happy to have the Courts in Rocky River. It employs 26 full-time employees including clerks and judges. Rocky River Court is one of the five municipal courts in the State of Ohio that operate on a balanced budget.

Judge Fitzsimmons thanked the Council and Administration and stated she loves following the Recreation Department as she is a regular user including the track. Judge Fitzsimmons stated that she does not have news concerning expenditures as it is the same yearly. There are no raises for the employees because they are not in the kind of financial condition to do so except for two merit increases. There is a full-time employee retiring from Judge Fitzsimmons staff next year and is being replaced by a current part-time employee. The part-time position will be filled by an extern from the law school, at no cost. Judge Fitzsimmons is trying to do many things to keep expenditures down. The good news even though this is a difficult year, the court will be paid off in 2021. That money, \$250,000, then can be used to offset some other costs. This year will be a struggle. The courts went from 20,654 cases in 2011 to 8,349 traffic and DUI cases in 2018. This year is even lower. Some it is attributable to North Olmsted, even since North Olmsted left the Courts, the cases are still going down. The Courts have no control over how many cases are sent to them causing a decrease in collections that are coming into the Court. The other big impacts causing a decrease in collections is the opioid epidemic as the majority of the cases are theft cases out of Great Northern Mall by opioid addicts and the Court cannot collect money from them. In fact, the Court spends money on them through the probation services fund to try to rehabilitate them. Judge Fitzsimmons said the Court does everything they can to minimize the amount of money spent because Rocky River Court that is the most connected to the free opportunities from the Cleveland Municipal Court. The Court collaborates with them so that the Court can get their defendants into all of their specialized dockets, which does not cost the Court money. Defendants are gotten into the Human Trafficking Docket, the Veterans Docket and the Drug Court Docket. There are more Rocky River Court graduates there than the entire Cleveland Municipal Court of 13 judges. Rocky River Court uses these assets as much as they can but you cannot get money from an opioid addict.

- Councilman O'Donnell asked if under the Statutory Funding Mechanisms for the courts, when North Olmsted sends Rocky River these cases and they do not pay, can't the Court send North Olmsted the bill for these cases. Judge Fitzsimmons said no. Judge Fitzsimmons said the other thing they receive are building code cases from North Olmsted and they are desperate cases. They take so long to do with constant monitoring and they are people that cannot pay any money. North Olmsted sends cases after they see it is someone who cannot pay. Councilman O'Donnell said that if Rocky River can send a bill, he thinks we should.
- Mr. Moran stated that what North Olmsted has taken from the Courts and what they have given are people that do not pay.

Mr. Moran said that both Judge Fitzsimmons and Judge Hagan are involved not only on the correction side, but also on the rehabilitation side. They are trying to correct the people on long term to get back to health. Judge Fitzsimmons stated that all the people they put on interlock because of drinking and driving need a camera as of January 1, 2020 so they can be sure the defendant is the one blowing into it. The Court pays for that and costs are increasing.

- Mr. Sindelar asked if there are grants to help with the costs. Mr. Moran stated that grants are applied for but never received because the Rocky River Courts operate on a balanced budget. The Courts that do not, apply for these grants and are granted the money. Judge Fitzsimmons said they are not giving up, however.
- The Mayor stated that what Rocky River needs to do is work on abolishing Mayor's Court in the State of Ohio. Ohio is one of two states that has Mayor's Courts and it is wrong and it is decimating the host city of a multijurisdictional municipal court that this could happen, it is just wrong. The Mayor is not sure what it is going to take. Judge Fitzsimmons stated that the amount of money North Olmsted has made on their Mayor's Court is the reason they do it. Judge Fitzsimmons will do everything possible to make it through the next two years until the Capital money comes back into their budget. Mr. Sindelar asked if other cities might do the same thing. Judge Fitzsimmons said there is a new Mayor in Fairview Park and most of them are ok using the Rocky River Courts.

Judge Fitzsimmons discussed Bail Reform. The Courts are not allowed to do a cash bail and the change in collection has changed. A person cannot stay in jail if they are there because of non-payment. The problem is that many of the things came together for a perfect storm, but the biggest reason is the decrease in cases. The cases they can usually collect on are traffic, but there is a big decrease with traffic cases and an increase of cases that require a lot of probation time and the Judges time because they are people with lots of serious mental health issues and addiction issues.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked if it is still true that North Olmsted charges what Rocky River Court charges. Clerk Comery said that they are close to the same amount. North Olmsted does not have probation. Rocky River gets first time DUI's. People driving with heroin take their first time DUI's and do not get probation. Many times the Court finds out about a serious drug addiction during that first DUI and then have them for two

years.

- Mr. Hunt asked for more detail regarding the bail modifications. Bonds are a safety net that can be applied to fines and costs but is that being eliminated on all cases. The Judge said not if there is a warrant on a defendant then she can set a cash bail. If there is a warrant or a domestic violence and need a TPO a cash bail can always be set. Everyday there are people the first time in court and they do not have an address and Judge Fitzsimmons has to let them out on personal bond. The Rocky River bond schedule is going to be the schedule used by the state and are trying to get every judge on board with this. Felonies are the problem and are still coming to Rocky River Court and we are not supposed to set a bond, but the court does.

Mr. Moran stated that the Court may need some computer systems going into 2020. The long-term future is that the building will need some improvements after the building is paid off in 2021. The balanced budget is getting more and more challenging. The lack of POPAS has also affected the collections at the Court.

Clerk Comery has an employee that has helped improve what is collected, by forming their own collections department. Clerk Comery did a shifting of employees and this employee works two days a week on the collection process and her results have been phenomenal. Cases that usually go to collections, this employee has called and has made incredible inroads on what has been collected. Clerk Comery is hoping the next reports from Finance show improvement. Clerk Comery and her staff try everything they can to keep above the fray. The Mayor asked what their estimate is on the uncollected balance. Clerk Comery said it is over \$1,000,000. Clerk Comery stated that in the municipal level, if a maximum of a 6-month jail sentence, the only penalty somebody faces is financial. To strap a court from enforcing a penalty against an individual, who chose to do whatever they chose to do, seems to be contradictory. With an improved economy, she is hoping she can do better in collections.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked if the uncollectible is because some of the people cannot afford it and some that will just never be collected. Is there any way of knowing what is collectible of the outstanding? Clerk Comery's employee is calling these people and it has been amazing because some of the people they did not think would, have paid. She feels it comes down to an attitude of people seem annoyed that they have been charged and they directly say they will not pay.

Clerk Comery said there is an illusion within the state that Rocky River is a city/community that is financial able to sustain whatever they asked for in a grant. This is not a Court that just deals with people from surrounding communities, but half of which comes from Cleveland, Lorain, Lake County, Wellington, etc. The people come from all over because of the two interstates. The concept that Rocky River is an economically buoyant client base, but the defendants in this Court are not all liquid.

- The Mayor asked if they ask for demographic information in the grant application. The Mayor does not understand why they do not look at the constellation of whom the Court is actually serving. Ms. Comery stated that this is a Supreme Court issue and they have had a couple of turnovers with who runs this program.

- Mr. Sindelar asked if liens are filed against defendants. They have not because they often do not have anything to lien against. The Court uses Capital Recovery, a collection agency, for ten years. Most of the collections are with the attorney general because at tax time refunds go through the filter and if they owe \$100.00 or more the Courts get whatever they can from that. That has proved to be very fruitful.

Clerk Comery does not want to get too aggressive because she does not want the court to appear money hungry because that is not what the court is about.

Mr. Moran thanked Judge Fitzsimmons and Clerk Comery for everything they do for all the communities in the court system and thanked them for being available this morning.

Wastewater Treatment Plant

The WWTP, represented by Superintendent CarrieAnne McConnell, was the next department to present its budget, under the leadership of Councilman Furry. Mr. Furry welcomed Superintendent McConnell. Mr. Furry had recently distributed the 2020 fiscal budget review and the proposed operating budget. Mr. Furry then introduced Superintendent Carrie Anne McConnell.

Mrs. McConnell said it has been a busy year with another busy year coming up. Last year Mrs. McConnell talked about the No Feasible Alternative Study they had been required to perform. The WWTP came up with a series of improvements and projects that need to be completed by 2040. The WWTP was pleased because the study was submitted last December and in August found out that the EPA accepted their proposal. What is positive about that is a number of alternatives some of which were in the \$70-100 million dollar ranges and this proposal is in the \$11 million project. Fingers were crossed because historically the EPA has not accepted this type of project in sanitary sewer overflow communities but related to combine sewer overflow communities. One of things proposed is the need to continue to make Capital Improvements over the continuum. At the end of the 2040 period, they would like to see an increase in the biological treatment capacity. Through the permit process and other court cases that are out there, by the time the end of the schedule comes, that will no longer be a requirement. If it is, it will be something that will come in naturally under a need to improve the secondary treatment process. That process is now 40 years old and will need major improvements in the near future.

Mr. Furry added that per the EPA, the City of Rocky River owns the WWTP but in the late 60's Fairview, Bay, Westlake and River jointly owning it proportionately.

Hazen and Sawyer spent the past year working with the staff on a critical needs assessment in the plant and then took that assessment and looked at everything, scored every piece of equipment and structure throughout the plant based on its reliability, current decay and how the WWTP can phase these projects over the next ten to fifteen years. They came up with was a series of projects including this chemically enhanced primary treatment that is required to do as part of the NFA that will cost \$32 million dollars over that period of time. When Mrs. McConnell came to Rocky River, North Olmsted had just performed a \$32-34 million dollar project at the North Olmsted plant because of similar situations with over-flows in the plant. The fact that so far it is

only a \$32 million dollars is a big win. This does not include further flow monitoring. The Flow and Strength Study will be performed in 2020 instead of 2021 and during this there will be somewhere around 40 or 50 flow meters out in all four cities because they will build a hydraulic model of the entire collection system. Once the model is built, they will be able to determine where in the four cities further collection system improvements need to be made. That is a further cost, but broken up between the cities dependent on who has the biggest issues.

- Mr. Moran asked if Mrs. McConnell expects any changes from what is happening right now. Mrs. McConnell thinks the percentages will turn out similar to the last several years. What it will do is highlight where each community can spend their money most effectively.

Mrs. McConnell discussed Integrated Planning, which is another good important thing that happened this year. In January, Congress passed a requirement that all states allow integrated planning when dealing with major infrastructure issues through their environmental protection agencies. As a result, the WWTP has been able to delay some major decision making things regarding Capital Equipment Projects are necessary by looking at their stormwater system, their water treatment, their sanitary and green infrastructure in the way their community both financially and what the community wants rather than having multiple orders come down from the EPA. Mrs. McConnell has attended a couple of different discussions on this. She is hoping to get involved in the workgroup that is being assembled. She attended a work session in October and met the Ohio EPA Director and met people from the US EPA and getting the situation out there as being a SSO Community, but have the same kind of financial situations that any other SSO and CSO Community has. There is that assumption that this plant is in Rocky River and serves Bay Village and Westlake and should not have financial issues. The reality is that because of Rocky River's commitment in fixing their infrastructure over long term, Fairview Park's reality of their financial situation, it is not something they can say to the rate payers that you shall pay \$100 per cubic feet of water treatment. It is not a reality in Fairview Park. The rubric that is used through the NFA process to determine a city's financial capability shows that if these capital improvements to Rocky River that River would surpass that level of financial capabilities. Mrs. McConnell applied for funding through DOPWIC and was denied again based on a number issues. Scoring categories were created that WWTP are completely ineligible for. If we have ratepayers we can tell them how much to pay so why would we need the money. There is a category now that if you can charge fees, you do not get points in the category, but if you cannot charge fees you get four points in the category. The other issue is historically the WWTP has made continuous improvement to the treatment facility. The Ohio EPA requires the WWTP to maintain the facility and require the city to have a licensed operator running that facility and as a licensed operator, Mrs. McConnell has a personnel responsibility to maintain the facility. There are criminal charges out there against people who do not do their job. Because we are following the law, they now change the way they are aging the infrastructure. Any capital improvement in the entire plant that is the age of the plant as far as DOPWIC is concerned.

Mrs. McConnell stated that there have been some significant personnel issues this year at the WWTP. There was a pre-treatment inspection in September that highlighted some significant issues with a staff member. Fortunately, Mrs. McConnell has worked out some plans with the EPA and is restructuring the staffing. People will be solely responsible for the laboratory and

pretreatment program. She is building the management team through this process and cross training and incentivizing people to learn other jobs so if we are in this situation now, there will be union members that can perform that work. Mrs. McConnell is proposing that the clerk position be pulled from the union and creating a pretreatment and laboratory coordinator position who will be responsible for keeping the lab running how it has to run and focusing on pretreatment program. There is an increase in personnel costs this year, but has been tight as she can so the total utility budget is only increased 3.48%. The insurance costs have been going up for the last two years significantly. Director Costello said that this is an industry specific increase and the entire budget needs to be increase by \$7,000 in order to pay the increase of the insurance. The Management Committee did approve this increase.

Mrs. McConnell is still fighting the fight with DOPWIC and will be submitting an official appeal with a number of bullet points. It is lunacy to say that the plant is as old as 2020. The Mayor has reached out to Representative Greenspan. Mrs. McConnell's two-page letter is also going down to Columbus to Linda Baliff, who is the head of this program. They have serious issues and some representation issues that the Mayor is working on. The DOPWIC Board is made up of seven individuals, other metropolitan areas have nine and we need those two additional seats to represent villages, cities and townships.

AECOMM is close to wrapping up. There is a significant issue on design that Mrs. McConnell is working through with AECOMM. That project will not be done as quickly as hoped, but she may be coming back to Council regarding this. It has been a frustrating situation. Hazen and Sawyer have been the consulting engineer for the last two years but there are some issues on this project.

The teamster's agreement was voted affirmatively. The Mayor said it will be at Council's places on Monday.

President Moran thanked Mrs. McConnell for her love of her job and being part of this team. Thank you and Mr. Furry for all the work that has been done. Mr. Furry also noted that the emergency language has been eliminated from the majority of ordinances.

The Mayor is thrilled to have Mrs. McConnell at the WWTP. Not only do we recognize it, the other three communities and their engineers, but also the Ohio EPA who has elevated Mrs. McConnell to leadership positions. That is huge for the City of Rocky River to have that relationship. The Mayor noted that Mrs. McConnell was able to present with her dad at a professional conference. A very proud moment for her dad.

Senior Center

The Senior Center, represented by Director Deborah Huff, was the next department to present its budget, under the leadership of Councilman Sindelar.

Mr. Sindelar said that it is always with great pride to introduce Director Huff. Mr. Sindelar said the Senior Center is the crown jewel of the city and on the top of services that the city provides to increase the quality of life for seniors in Rocky River. The Senior Center has flourished under Director Huff's leadership. Mr. Sindelar also stated that the Senior Center is working on another

Accreditation for the Senior Center under the direction of Director Deb Huff.

Director Huff thanked Mr. Sindelar for the introduction. The budget before Council is not much different from last year's budget. There are three potential retirements this year. Gail Hines, the Deli Lunch Manager in the kitchen, Laurie Rokakis, Social Worker and Ruth Santo, the Deli Lunch Cashier. Ruth has not mentioned retirement, but is age eligible.

As far as major requests, the original front doors of the building have been serviced multiple times in the last three years and may need to be replaced in 2020. The roof over the garage and classroom needs to be replaced and is in Mr. Balla's building budget. The dishwasher in the kitchen has been limping along but when parts are no longer available, it will need replaced.

- President Moran asked if the \$25,000 listed is the correct price for a new dishwasher. That is the correct amount for a commercial dishwasher.

This year a kitchen freezer was replaced but was under warranty. The Senior Center had multiple vehicle repairs, however took delivery of the van that was made possible from a grant from NOACA and a very generous resident who donated \$15,000 and the Giant Eagle Grant for \$5,000 covered the cost of the van. This vehicle is wonderful and is a low floor 14 passenger van with the capability of having two wheelchairs at the same time. The low floor makes all the difference in the world for people with walkers, etc. The low floor vehicles will be the standard senior transportation in the country. The Senior Center also took delivery on their car and they are very grateful for that.

On the future horizon, the Senior Center needs an addition to provide a lecture hall and gym for classes and an extra set of restrooms. Also on the list is a new generator for the kitchen, security cameras and a storage shed for outdoor equipment.

The biggest change in the budget is the request for a full-time position for the Social Worker. The residents have an increasing number of needs along with an increase of seniors.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked about the possibility of two part-time social workers. Ms. Huff said that she has had that discussion but the problem is the communication does not flow as well. Rocky River is large enough for one full-time person, but having two part-time people, it is not large enough to divide equally.
- Mr. Sindelar asked about the security camera. The Mayor stated that these security cameras will be tied into the police department, but the expenditure will be out of the Senior Center budget.
- Mr. Klym asked if the request for a full-time Social Worker is built into the 2020 budget. The Mayor stated that discussions are continuing. There is an issue of overlapping two part-time social workers for communication purposes. This is an area that is expanding and the service to families who do not live in Rocky River has increased greatly.
- Mr. Hunt commented that he sees many seniors referred by social workers for various

needs. Where does the Senior Center receive most referrals? Ms. Huff said some from families, police department, paramedics and the Building Department. This year alone, Mrs. Rokakis has already worked with 400 clients and it is growing.

- Mr. Klym works with senior citizens at the Westerly in Lakewood. There is a social worker for each of the three buildings.
- Pinzone Towers recently added a part-time social worker, but still rely heavily on Mrs. Rokakis. Mr. Moran talked about the meeting at Pinzone Towers that Ms. Huff and Mrs. Rokakis attended. There are over 100 apartments at Pinzone Towers and other apartments and facilities that house many seniors. Seniors do move to Rocky River because of the Senior Center. There are agencies that are placing seniors in Rocky River because of the housing and the help the Senior Center gives in managing services.

Ms. Huff discussed the activities currently at the Senior Center. Rocky River Seniors came in second in the County Mind Challenge with 15 communities participating. This year there will be 32-36 cities participating. This was an original idea by Mrs. Schaefer that exploded. Another collaboration is the two weeks of Senior Olympics next summer. All the Westshore Senior Centers collaborating. Seniors can be as competitive as the high school students. The opening and closing ceremonies will be held in Rocky River.

Another activity that began this year is a concert series called "Art Renaissance Tremont" and they are providing world-renowned musicians that perform at the Senior Center. This has brought in a completely new group of people attending the Senior Center.

The State Accreditation process has also begun at the Senior Center. Information has been submitted and on November 22nd three assessors come to the center to see how things are done here in Rocky River. Filing for the National Accreditation was very helpful in applying for the State. This has been twice the amount of work, but easier as there was information already compiled. The Cuyahoga County Municipal Office on Aging are starting a pilot program to encourage and assist three senior centers in obtaining state accreditation. The state has also developed a certification for senior center directors and program coordinators. This is offered once a year in March in Columbus and Ms. Huff and Mrs. Rokakis will be applying for that.

- Mr. Sindelar asked how the accreditation will be maintained and how often. Ms. Huff said it is every five years and they will need to re-apply. Ms. Huff said she is lucky with her staff and volunteers who are very engaged in this process and thrilled when it is achieved. This keeps the center at the top of their game.
- Mr. O'Donnell asked if the state has accredited any senior center yet. Ms. Huff said there are five and all are members of the Board. The Mayor added that this Senior Center's funding and structure is different than theirs. The assessors were very interested in funding, support and volunteerism at our Senior Center. Ms. Huff said that they will find out after the holidays if they were successful in their application. Ms. Huff said they have already asked her to be part of the Board. That is a good sign.

Ms. Huff said it has been a fantastic year and the volunteers are their most valuable asset.

The Mayor added that many of the city's directors hold incredible leadership positions throughout the state. It is such a source of pride for the Mayor that these directors take their profession so seriously and really elevate the things they can share with others. The Mayor applauds these directors.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked about specific for the requested addition. Ms. Huff said that a lecture hall would be wonderful. There is currently a lot of set-up/take down in the arts and crafts room and it is not big enough. There are multiple things going on.
- Mr. Moran asked how many vehicles are in the Senior Center fleet. Ms. Huff said there are five and she is looking to replace two more aging vehicles over the next year.

Police Department

Councilman Hunt introduced Chief Kelly Stillman and thanked him for attending the budget meeting.

Chief Stillman said that the Police Department is staffed at 33 with a full staff of 34. Chief Stillman said there was a test in July with 18 who passed but was only able to offer one position but she went to the City of Independence. Chief Stillman will try another testing agency called the National Testing Network. It is a nationwide system and hopefully we will get better results. When Lt. Crates retires in March the Chief will have to hire two officers. Mr. Hunt asked about the School Resource Officer and how that will affect the department. Chief Stillman said that there will be considerations there. Chief Stillman along with the Mayor have been trying to work with a part-time/seasonal model. The SRO in the Middle School scored number one on the Sergeant test and he has a high probability of taking over that role in March. Chief Stillman is not sure how the SRO Officer will be filled.

- Mr. Klym asked if there are any changes that need to be made within the Civil Service rules or ordinances to allow for a bigger pool to choose from. Chief Stillman said the Civil Service Commission is fantastic and things change based on the climate. Chief Stillman said that no one wants to be a police officer. It is not the most sought after position as it used to be. This is a nationwide epidemic. Trying to find qualified candidates is a challenge.
- Mr. Moran asked if there is a better opportunity of candidates coming from other police departments. The Chief said there were a number of candidates that took the test, passed and were interviewed, but it is always suspect as to why someone is leaving another department.
- Chief Stillman said a number of departments use a lateral entry with no testing and other officers from another department apply and through the lateral entry can be hired.

Capital requests include the Police facility and the usual software maintenance agreements that are being requested. Three new vehicles were purchased this year - two were put into service and the third in the spring. There are no new vehicles listed for purchase for the police department

this year. There is an increase on the line item for tires. The price of tires have increased and the department ran a little short so increased this line to cover future purchases. POPAS is still experiencing the decline of volunteers to work it. The new police officers do not need the extra income.

The Marine Patrol will stay the same. The department will apply for the same funds and grants. Mr. Hunt said there are handful of officers that enjoy working this detail. Is this worthwhile to continue? Chief Stillman said it is beyond worthwhile. This boat is so high tech that there are only a few certified operators. Lt. Crates is leaving and Officer Boncek is contemplating moving on in his career within the next year. Chief is trying to groom someone to take over the Marine Patrol but it is not an easy job.

- Mr. Moran asked if the officers are wearing cameras on the Marine Patrol. Chief Stillman is not sure, but he will look into it. Body cameras are not waterproof so he does not think they wear them.

The Chief said the twelve-hour shifts are working out well. The Chief has had to adjust his schedule to spend time with members of the department throughout the week. Westlake, North Olmsted and Fairview Park have gone to twelve-hour shifts.

Chief Stillman said the department sends most of the prisoners to Westlake because they have been more accommodating. The police call for jail space and whoever has space determines where the prisoners go. The cost is running about \$4,500 a month. The department is charged for prisoners held over two hours.

There are bidding issues regarding the new facility. Council is very anxious to see how the next round comes back. The Mayor has met with Bowen & Associates and all of the trades but two have been awarded. The general trades and plumbing are going out for rebid. The Mayor will be back to Council in January. The timeline was affected after the second rebid and now we are looking at March 2021 for completion. Bowen will visit with Council concerning their projections and the difference of what is coming in today. It is quite divergent from what was said earlier. There are reasons in the market place for this but the Mayor and Director Costello are not sure it addresses the extreme per square foot charge that the administration is seeing. Bowen will meet with Council after the first of the year. The Mayor explained that the engineer has an estimate and if the bid is over by 10% the city needs to reject and rebid. This is part of the public bidding process on a huge project like this, but not without its disappointments too.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked how things are going in the temporary location. The Chief said there is now a maintenance man in the building and they have access to the underground garage now and there is a contractor to shovel and salt the sidewalks. Things the department needs are being addressed. The Chief gave kudos to his department for all the work in moving the department.

Councilman Hunt thanked the Chief and his department for all their service to the city.

Mr. Moran concurred with the Mayor regarding the leadership roles the Directors have taken on. Mr. Moran thanked Chief Stillman for everything he does for Rocky River and his leadership

roles outside the City of Rocky River.

Safety Services

The Service Division and Capital Improvements Division, represented by Director Mary Kay Costello and Commissioner Snyder, was the next department to present its budget, under the leadership of Councilman Shepherd.

Mr. Shepherd discussed the handout reflecting the summary of the major capital improvements anticipated for 2020 and a street map that shows streets that have been repaved and the streets going forward that the city intends to do.

The Safety-Service Department consists of three full-time employees and two part-time employees in City Hall. The part-time employees operate the switchboard. The rest of the Service Department has 50 full-time employees, which is two more than last year. One of these positions is filling a vacant general labor position. One position has been added with an addition to the Parks Department to help improve the parks. The city has four-credentialed arborist who do many other things for the service department. There are no official retirements at this time.

Mr. Shepherd introduced Commissioner Snyder who is here to discuss the Capital Expenditure Equipment list and will briefly discuss what is anticipated or needing to be purchased or budgeted for incase the city needs it. The first item on the agenda is a camera truck, which will be incorporated into the sewer maintenance department. The justification for the camera truck is the need to perform exploratory digs when looking for a T or a lateral line. A camera truck will allow the workers to check the mains and laterals within the streets. As the service department moves forward this will allow GIS to map the locations of T's, catch basins and manholes. GIS stands for Geographical Information System, which uses similar GPS coordinates north, south, east and west. This is a self-contained truck with a computer system, a monitor and a launching unit in the back. The launching unit can be lowered down into the mains and is controlled to obtain video footage and collect other data regarding location. The main unit has a lateral launcher attached so it can shoot the mains and further mark location and check conditions and issues in mains. Ideally, it will shoot the sewer main, sanitary and storm, and on the way back run the lateral launcher, mark both sides and locations and record data. It will help expedite the repairs. The city currently subcontracts all the camera work out and it is expensive. This truck will pay for itself in four or five years.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked what the upkeep is on the technology. Mr. Snyder explained that there is a software and mechanical aspect. There is an annual fee for software updates. The mechanics are comfortable handling the vehicle aspect but the camera repairs will need to be done by a specially trained technician. Down the road, it may be able to be handled in-house.
- Mr. Moran asked if the surrounding communities could share with a fee attached. Rocky River is one of the last communities to purchase one. The service department has started mutual aid in other areas and that could be addressed. Mr. Moran asked if Rocky River could use other community's camera truck. Unfortunately, other service departments use their truck on a daily basis. The Mayor stated that the city did look at Bay Village's old

camera truck but the city needs reliability.

The key to success for this truck is the training for the operator. Whoever operates this needs finesse not only understanding the mechanical aspects, but with the camera and software. Once it enters the sewer system, a lot of damage can be done if not used properly. Commission Snyder feels it would be best served to have an employee with this as their primary responsibility, as in a Special Equipment Operator. There are a couple of individuals in-house that would do well. Director Costello said that this will pay for itself in 3-4 years. The city televises every sanitary and storm sewer for every waterline project that is done. The city has to know if there are problems before the contractor goes in to work on a waterline. There is a lot of water and sewer work. Every application to DOPWIC has televised lines along with paving projects, the same thing. It is an important aspect for planning and very useful as the city moves forward into the storm water management aspect of the sewer collection system. The city needs to begin with work with private residents in the neighborhood where dollars have been invested in the lines and ask people to disconnect downspouts to keep storm water out of the system. The lateral camera will need to be launched to check on resident's laterals. It is going to become a piece of equipment that is very important and multifaceted. This machine is so technical that city's want their own person operating their equipment so we would be borrowing their employee to go with the vehicle.

The Mayor asked Director Costello to do a cost analysis to look at costs associated with subcontracting this work, but it is also cost avoidance. The Mayor said to have a camera truck and see what is out there so fixes can be made prior to big problems cannot be quantified. Hours and hours of work will be avoided with crews looking for T's and it will save the resident's yards from being dug up.

The next vehicle on the agenda is a one-ton dump truck to replace a 2006 F550 with 84,000 miles on it. Going forward the city is looking to incorporate stainless steel beds on the trucks. It will be a better investment. Next are two 2-1/2 ton dump trucks to replace a 2007 International with 62,634 miles on it and a 1999 Freightliner with 63,000 miles on it. These are used for plow trucks and one has a hydraulic leak in the dump cylinder that needs repaired in the amount of \$6,000. These trucks are very aged. The next vehicle is a 2003 31-yard Sterling Packard that has 101,000 miles on it and needs a transmission soon. The street sweeper that needs to be replaced is a 1992 and it has 22,000 miles and over 5,000 hours on it. The 75-yard semi-trailer is a 2000 and needs replaced. These trailers have a push cylinder in them. Commissioner Snyder would like to purchase two leaf machines. There is one self-contained unit and the city is looking to purchase one larger capacity rider and one similar to what the city has but with a tier 4 diesel engine in it. Next would be to purchase two refuse scooter units to replace a 2012 with over 6,683 hours and a 2013 with 6,250 hours on it. The last item on the agenda is the one lift truck for sign and signal, which would replace a 1997 F350 to be replaced with an F550 with better capability.

- Mr. Shepherd added that the scooters are in the budget but the city is looking at issues regarding recycling and waste over the next few years. They are there if needed as the city tries to maintain a fleet of six scooters that are operational. We will see what the future holds.

Director Costello discussed the water line projects. Council was instrumental in getting the city into the Cleveland Division of Water Waterline Maintenance Program. As a result, the city has completed over \$11 million dollars of waterline work since 2006 with \$10 million of this in Cleveland Water funding. Next year the Cleveland Division of Water has approved three waterline projects for construction in 2020 on Story, Shoreland and Struhar (engineering began in 2019). Cleveland Water funding for this work totals \$2 million in construction funds. Story Road will be bid as a water main replacement and paving program. Story Road funding is \$1,190.00; Shoreland is \$464,168 plus engineering and Struhar, \$464,265 plus engineering.

In addition, the city has been granted funding by the Cleveland Division of Water to replace Collver, Oak and Morewood, which is over \$1.2 million worth of waterline work which the city was able to leverage in the DOPWIC application as part of the matching requirement. The city was successful in obtaining this loan for over a \$7.8 million project over \$4.3 million being provided by the DOPWIC loan. The city is really knocking it out of the park with leveraging Cleveland Water funding. The city can use the water funding for Story Road to add paving; Shoreland will be repaved and Struhar concrete repairs will be done.

In 2020 the City Paving Program will manage the following paving projects: Eastlook, Scenic, Eldora, Archwood, Marlys, Shoreland (curb to curb), entrance to Old Detroit (off of Detroit), Senior Center/Recreation parking lot, South Island/Riverdale (to connect to widened road), Middlepost, Westhaven, Kingsbury (asphalt overlay onto repaired concrete road) and new sidewalks at Recreation/Civic Center. Director Costello will be meeting with residents on Riverdale to discuss the Riverdale Road Widening Project.

Another exciting project will be the Congestion Mitigation Air Quality along with Fairview Park to improve Center Ridge signaling, reduce congestion, new signals and paint the signals. This project in partnership with Fairview will add new sidewalks, pedestrian signals, cross over ramps and match the stamped concrete crosswalks on Center Ridge and control some of the traffic coming south on Wagar towards Center Ridge Road which is a high accident area. The city will manage traffic better and ease some operations for travelers.

Director Costello thanked Council for things like the Marine Patrol and how important that is for the safety of residents with outdoor recreation, but when the Director can bring this information to MetroParks, or talk to the County on a lake access plan, it goes a long way as a priority for City Council to support. She really appreciates Council's support. It has been a privilege and a joy.

Councilman Shepherd noted that there is a major sewer project that has been in front of Council for the Morewood/Oak/Collver area and the city received DOPWIC Funding in the amount of \$4.3 for that. It is a \$7.8 million project. There are many other projects in the summary.

- Councilman Klym also discussed the possibility of adding electric vehicles to the fleet. Maybe replacing the building department vehicle with an electric vehicle as an opportunity for test cases as they do not drive very far. Also, adding the idle management system to city vehicles. Director Costello agreed, especially for police vehicles. The Mayor added that there would need to be work done on that as far as building the infrastructure for charging stations on City Hall Campus to accommodate

that. Mr. Shepherd said that this is the direction the world is heading.

President Moran said that some of the things done today, looking at long term situations per department, Director Costello has done this with all the city's vehicles. Council still has the opportunity to talk to you for a couple more meetings, but your dedication to this city has been unbelievable. Talking to people at the Service Garage at all hours, Monday night meetings - Council cannot thank you enough for what you have done for the city. Thank you. Director Costello said it has been a privilege and an honor and has loved every minute. She will miss it and all the projects coming up and her replacement is coming in at a very exciting time. She is looking forward to what will happen in this next budget year. She always appreciates the value Council adds to the budget. It makes her work better. Mr. Shepherd stated that Director Costello has been fabulous and Councilman O'Donnell thanked Director Costello as well.

Fire Department

The Fire Department, represented by Chief Lenart, was the next department to present its budget, under the leadership of Councilman Hunt.

This year the Chief has been working on specs for a new ambulance. He has one out of service and one with a new motor a few years ago and it is in the back-up spot now. They are desperately in need of a new one. This city is a busy place with the newest ambulance being three years old and already has 50,000 miles on it but working very well. For the year, the department is closing in on 3,000 calls again this year. The ambulance he is looking at will run in the range of \$275 – 280,000. The Chief is upping it to a medium duty ambulance, which is more like a dump truck chassis that should allow for better maintenance issues. This chassis gives the ambulance a better turning radius and better technology. The ambulances are what saves lives in the city.

- Mr. Furry asked if obtaining the ambulance will be quicker than the ladder truck. Chief Lenart said that ambulances are a lot of work to order. Rocky River is one of the last city's that do not purchase on the STS portion of the state bidding contracts so every line needs to be detailed. The committee prepares the packet, Director Costello reviews it, kicks it back for more detail and when it is done it is 160 page document. Mr. Moran asked if this is necessary. Chief Lenart responded yes. It points to getting the ambulance that will function appropriately for how business is done in Rocky River. Mr. Furry asked if it is part of the CBA. Chief Lenart said there is no CBA control on that. The lead-time is about nine months on a new ambulance. The Chief's goal is to have something delivered this time next year.

The Fire Department also needs new fire hoses and appliances. The current equipment is outdated and aged and it is time to replace it. It will bring Rocky River up to par to what the other cities are using. That will run about in the \$25,000 range. The current appliances are twenty years old.

Engine 65 is a 1996, almost 25 years old. Fire trucks will take 8 months to specify an engine to bid in 2021. The Chief said the lead-time is 14-16 months for the delivery of a fire truck. Corrosion is the number one problem with the trucks. He is trying to fight the corrosion and is

looking to do stainless steel trucks, which is adding another 6 weeks to 2 months onto the order. He would like to plan in 2020, bid in 2021 and have it delivered in 2022 and it will cost in the \$650,000 range but it will last at least 25 years. That is the Chief's goal to get 25 years out of everything.

The Chief said that Engine 64, the newer 2006 engine is feeling some corrosion issues. Probably in 2021, the Chief will need to send it out for a mini refurbish to deal with the body corrosion and a repaint. This year the Chief did an underbody erosion proofing resistance process to see how it works. It was \$1100 but every vehicle was treated underneath. It would be an annual application.

The Department was reviewed by ISO at the end of October and is hoping the department is moving upward.

Mr. Hunt asked about ambulance billing. Chief said it has been stagnate. He has discussed this with the billing company. For one, insurance companies are not willing to come off their money. They soft bill the residents and their insurance companies will pay what the Medicare numbers are. The Fire Department bills at \$575 for a basic run and \$675 for an advance run. An advance run is anything greater than a blood pressure plus \$12.00 a loaded mile. The department bills over a million dollars a year, but the insurance companies fight it and drag it out. The actual revenue comes in at about \$550.00. The company, Life Force Management, confirms the coding is correct because if it is not coded correctly, Medicare/Medicaid will fight it.

Chief Lenart is in talks with the Cleveland Clinic regarding ET3. It is a different billing concept that Medicare is looking at. It is going to allow the department different ways to bill on runs he has not been billing on. It is going to bring Telemedicine into the field, which will create a billable run for the Department. The Chief works hard at trying to find different ways to leverage what they do daily. Community paramedic is a new buzzword now where they want the paramedics to check on homes of the elderly, to be sure residents are taking their medications, etc. Without a billing mechanism to it, the Chief cannot take a paramedic out of work to check on the residents. There is no advantage to the Department, but there is a benefit to the hospital.

- Mr. O'Donnell asked about SCBA air pacs. Rocky River's air pacs run on a different air pressure than other communities. The NFPA says firefighters need 45 minutes of air while fighting a fire. This is something for the horizon if grant funding is not secured.

Mr. Hunt thanked Chief Lenart for his and his department's service and taking care of our residents every day. Chief Lenart thanked Council for all their support making the city a safer place.

Mr. Moran always receives stellar remarks on the fire department at how sensitive and caring the firefighters are. Their hard work is very much appreciated.

Mr. O'Donnell thanked everyone for coming.

As there was no further business by members of Council, Finance Chairman O'Donnell moved to close the meeting.

Vote: O'Donnell – aye	Moran – aye	Hunt – aye	Shepherd - aye	PASSED
4 ayes	0 nays			

The meeting was adjourned at 12:23 p.m.

Michael P. O'Donnell, Chairman
Finance Committee

Susan G. Pease
Clerk of Council

CITY OF ROCKY RIVER

December 9, 2019

The Regular Meeting of Council was called to order by Mr. Moran, President of Council at 7:00 p.m. in the David J. Cook Council Chambers.

Council Members Present: Mr. Hunt, Mr. Shepherd, Mr. O'Donnell, Mr. Furry,
Mr. Sindelar, Mr. Klym, Mr. Moran

Administration: Mayor Bobst, Mrs. Costello, Mr. Thomas

Law Director: Mr. Bemer

MOTION:

Moved by Mr. Moran, seconded by Mr. Furry that the reading of the minutes of the Legislative Meeting of November 25th and the Executive Session be waived and that the minutes be accepted as submitted.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes		0 nays	PASSED

Moved by Mr. Moran, seconded by Mr. O'Donnell that the reading of the minutes of the Committee-of-the-Whole Meeting of December 2nd be waived and that the minutes be accepted as submitted.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes		0 nays	PASSED

The meeting was opened with the Pledge of Allegiance and led by Webelos Troop #390.

MAYOR'S REPORT:

The Mayor thanked Webelos Troop #390 for meeting with her prior to this meeting and leading the Pledge of Allegiance. The Mayor said that if the Troop needed anything to feel free to contact her office. Thank you to the parents and the Troop Leaders as well.

Thank you to Early Childhood PTA for sponsoring All Aglow and the tree lighting Friday evening. Twenty-two trees were sponsored by the Rocky River Chamber of Commerce and were lit and a special shout out to Councilman Klym for this suggestion. The Pratt family assisted with the lighting of the trees. Thank you also to Angela Barth, Executor Director of the Chamber of Commerce and all the businesses that participated.

The Holiday Walk on Saturday was well attended with great weather. Thank you to Bill Brink, manager of Beachcliff Market Square, who puts together all the merchants and sponsors for this event.

Yesterday was the Holiday Home Tour sponsored by the Rocky River Women's Club who does so much for Meals on Wheels, the Senior Center, the Scholarship Program and a number of other organizations throughout the community. A big shout out to the Service Department for making sure the streets were free of leaves and other debris in front of the homes highlighted.

Before Council this evening is the Firefighters Collective Bargaining Agreement as well as the WasteWater Treatment Plant Collective Bargaining Agreement. The WWTP Collective Bargaining Agreement was reviewed by the Management Committee of the Treatment Plant and was recommended for approval. The Wage Ordinance will be amended this evening, by substitution of the exhibit, to reflect the changes in the Collective Bargaining Agreements.

The Mayor shared Building Department Statistics through November 30, 2019 as compared to November 30, 2018:

- Total permits are up to 1,639 compared to 1,599 last year
- The estimated additional valuation this year is \$42,923,000 compared to \$29,640,000 last year

The Mayor stated that the city appreciates the businesses and residents who continue to invest so enthusiastically in this great city.

The Mayor noted that 241 tons of leaves were picked up last week. Friday, December 20th will be the last day of tree lawn pick-up. The city will continue to pick up bagged leaves. A notice was sent out to residents on the Ready Notify System. If you do not receive Ready Notify notices, please go to the city's website to register.

The Mayor announced that the Resident Reference Guide is being finalized and will be delivered to residents at the beginning of January. The Reference Guide is something that residents should keep in their homes as it contains important information and contact numbers. This year the theme is "Being Part of the Puzzle". The Autism Center will be highlighted along with Recycling from a re-use and reduce perspective and information about the new Puzzle Sharing Program at the Rocky River Public Library. The city will also present the importance of completing the 2020 Census.

St. Christopher School's D.A.R.E. Graduation is Tuesday, December 17th at 9:00 a.m.

- President Moran inquired about the last day of leaf pick-up. Director Costello stated that the Service Department will tour the city twice the last week to pick-up leaves. Please watch the Service Department's Facebook page for notifications. The Mayor stated that a crew may be out on Saturday as well, depending on the weather.

LAW DIRECTOR'S REPORT: Law Director Bemer reported that Ordinance No. 90-19, Chapter 1321, Entitled Permit, Inspection and License Fees and Ordinance No. 92-19, Chapter 1141.11 Entitled Permit, Failure to Obtain Certificates and Orders have some common language that Councilman Klym and Mr. Bemer have been working on but have not quite completed. Please note that in No. 90-19 there was some significant reformatting done in the last week along with minor substantive changes. Please let Mr. Bemer know if there are any questions. The language has to do with assessment or failure to secure inspections or permits. Mr. Bemer recommends Council does not address these two Ordinances this evening.

COMMITTEE REPORTS: Finance Committee: Councilman O'Donnell said that there was a Finance Committee Meeting on December 6th beginning at 8:00 a.m. regarding Ordinance No. 94-19. This Ordinance was read for the first time on November 12th, discussed at the Committee-of-the-Whole Meeting on November 18th, a Public Hearing was held on November 25th and read for a second time and a Finance Committee Meeting on Friday, December 6th for over four hours. It was an insightful meeting attended by Mayor Bobst, Mr. Thomas, Director Costello, Director Holub, Chief Stillman, Chief Lenart, Director Huff, Superintendent McConnell, Judge Fitzsimmons, Clerk Comery and Commissioner Snyder. It was a dynamic overview of what is happening in the city. Director Thomas is working on some additional updates to the budget that Council will receive in their

packets this week. Please review as Ordinance No. 94-19 will be read for a third time at the Special Meeting next Monday.

- President Moran congratulated Mr. O'Donnell for putting a great meeting together. The four-hour meeting could have gone another four hours. The Directors had quite a bit to say about the great things in 2019 and the great things that will happen in 2020. Council learned quite a bit from all the presentations.

Planning, Zoning and Economic Development: President Moran said there is a Public Hearing scheduled for this Wednesday at 7:00 p.m. regarding 700 River. Thursday there will be a BZA Meeting at 7:00 p.m.

COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS: NONE

MOTION:

Moved by Mr. Moran seconded by Mr. Furry that the 72-hour notification rule be waived and that Ordinance No. 105-19 and Ordinance No. 106-19 be considered on this evening's agenda.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes	0 nays		PASSED

PUBLIC COMMENT: NONE

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

Mr. O'Donnell moved to 2nd Amend Ordinance No. 88-19 by substitution of an updated exhibit, seconded by Mr. Furry.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes	0 nays		PASSED

2nd AMMENDED ORDINANCE NO. 88-19 **BY: MICHAEL P. O'DONNELL**
AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE CREATING POSITIONS AND FIXING OR ESTABLISHING THE
ANNUAL SALARIES AND HOURLY RATES COMMENCING JANUARY 1, 2020 FOR THE
APPOINTED EMPLOYEES IN THE SEVERAL DIVISIONS AND DEPARTMENTS OF THE CITY OF
ROCKY RIVER
3rd READING

Mr. O'Donnell said this is an annual ordinance and has been discussed for nearly a month. As the Mayor alluded to, the amendment relates to the Collective Bargaining Agreement that the city reached with the Firefighters and the WasteWater Treatment Plant. Mr. O'Donnell has not had any questions regarding the Ordinance and moved for passage, seconded by Mr. Furry. Mr. Furry noted that when an exhibit is updated, the exhibit should be marked accordingly.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes	0 nays		PASSED

ORDINANCE NO. 90-19 **BY: JAMES W. MORAN**
AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE BUILDING CODE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE
CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, SPECIFICALLY CHAPTER 1321, ENTITLED PERMIT, INSPECTION
AND LICENSE FEES, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT "A"
ON HOLD

Mr. Bemer discussed this Ordinance during his report and he is still in the process of amending the exhibit.

ORDINANCE NO. 91-19

BY: JAMES W. MORAN

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE BUSINESS REGULATION CODE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, SPECIFICALLY: CHAPTER 705, ENTITLED BARBERSHOPS; CHAPTER 709, ENTITLED GAMING ROOMS; CHAPTER 725, ENTITLED OUTDOOR SHOWS; CHAPTER 731, ENTITLED TEMPORARY STORES AND SALES AT PRIVATE RESIDENCE; CHAPTER 737, ENTITLED TAXICABS AND VEHICLES FOR HIRE; CHAPTER 743, ENTITLED RESTAURANTS; AND CHAPTER 749, ENTITLED GOING OUT OF BUSINESS SALES, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT "A"

3rd READING

Mr. Moran said that there are details within the Codified Ordinances to assure things are done as written. This has been discussed the last 4-6 weeks. Mr. Moran moved for passage, seconded by Mr. Furry.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes	0 nays		PASSED

ORDINANCE NO. 92-19

BY: JAMES W. MORAN

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE DEVELOPMENT CODE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, SPECIFICALLY SECTION 1141.11, ENTITLED PERMIT, FAILURE TO OBTAIN CERTIFICATES AND ORDERS, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT "A"

ON HOLD

Mr. Bemer discussed this Ordinance during his report and he is still in the process of amending the exhibit.

ORDINANCE NO. 93-19

BY: JAMES W. MORAN

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE DEVELOPMENT CODE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, SPECIFICALLY SECTION 1141.21, ENTITLED ABATEMENT OF VIOLATIONS, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT "A"

3rd READING

Mr. Moran said that he discussed this ordinance with Commissioner Reich. Commissioner Reich's name will be added so he to can make decisions regarding abatement of violations. Mr. Moran moved for passage, seconded by Mr. O'Donnell.

Vote:	Hunt – aye	Shepherd – aye	O'Donnell – aye	Furry - aye
	Sindelar – aye	Klym – aye	Moran – aye	
	7 ayes	0 nays		PASSED

ORDINANCE NO. 94-19

BY: MICHAEL P. O'DONNELL

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE TO MAKE APPROPRIATIONS FOR THE CURRENT EXPENSES OF THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, OHIO DURING THE FISCAL YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2020

ON HOLD

Mr. O'Donnell stated that this ordinance will not be read this evening giving the Finance Director a chance to update the 2020 Budget. This will be read for a third time at next week's Special Meeting.

ORDINANCE NO. 95-19**BY: DAVID W. FURRY****AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY-SERVICE TO PURCHASE FERRIC CHLORIDE FOR THE WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLAN FROM PVS TECHNOLOGIES, INC., AT \$558.00 PER DRY TON FOR 2019****2nd READING**

This will be discussed more at next week's Committee-of-the-Whole Meeting.

RESOLUTION NO. 96-19**BY: CHRISTOPHER J. KLYM****AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND HER DESIGNEE TO SUBMIT AN APPLICATION FOR A \$100,000.00 GRANT FOR A COASTAL MANAGEMENT ASSISTANCE GRANT (CMAG) UNDER THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES OHIO COASTAL MANAGEMENT PROGRAM, AND IF GRANTED, TO ACCEPT SAID GRANT****2nd READING**

Mr. Klym stated this has been discussed for several weeks and in the sake of the lengthy agenda he will not belabor it tonight as this can be discussed more at next week's meeting. Director Costello did email Council a breakdown with the potential costs for the bridge over Spencer Creek, which amounts to just under \$500,000. The grant is for \$100,000 and the city will need to match the balance although Mr. Klym is sure the city will seek additional grants to help with the rest of that cost. The permitting process with ODNR is part of the process with Bradstreet's Pier.

ORDINANCE NO. 98-19**BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD****AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH MACKAY ENGINEERING AND SURVEYING COMPANY FOR PROFESSIONAL CONSULTING AND ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR 2020 AND 2021 AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN EXHIBIT "A"****2nd READING**

Mr. Shepherd said that this authorizes the Mayor to enter into a two-year contract with Mackay Engineering. Mackay Engineering has served the city well and has been the city's engineers for many years. They have a lot of institutional knowledge. Mr. Shepherd said the rates are reasonable with slight cost of living increases. This contract is terminable on 30-days notice if the city is dissatisfied or they are dissatisfied. Mr. Shepherd does not think there is an exclusivity clause so it would not prohibit the city if the city wanted a different type engineer. It is a contract but one that relies upon good faith and trust with the performance.

RESOLUTION NO. 99-19**BY: JAMES W. MORAN****A RESOLUTION SUPPORTING THE PLACEMENT OF A PROPOSED SHORE STRUCTURE AND APPROVAL OF A LAKE ERIE SUBMERGED LAND LEASE FROM OHIO DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES (ODNR) ADJACENT TO PERMANENT PARCEL NO. 302-09-006 AT 21508 AVALON DR., ROCKY RIVER, OHIO****2nd READING**

This is being presented to support the placement of a proposed shore structure at this address. A submerged land lease plan is being made and will need approval from the ODNR. This is the city's approval for this work to be completed. This will be discussed more at next week's meeting.

ORDINANCE NO. 100-19

BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY-SERVICE TO RENEW A CONTRACT FOR VARIOUS INSURANCE COVERAGES FOR THE ROCKY RIVER MUNICIPAL COURT WITH JACKSON DIEKEN & ASSOCIATES FOR THE YEAR 2020 AT A TOTAL COST OF \$9,840.00

2nd READING

Mr. Shepherd said this is for the Rocky River Court Insurance and the premium increase is .1%.

ORDINANCE NO. 101-19

BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY-SERVICE TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT FOR VARIOUS INSURANCE COVERAGES FOR THE ROCKY RIVER WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANT WITH MCGOWAN & COMPANY, INC. FOR THE YEAR 2020 AT A TOTAL COST OF \$84,991.00

2nd READING

Mr. Shepherd said this is the insurance for the WWTP. This was put out to bid in 2018 and the city is renewing this contract at a 9% increase due primarily to the cost and nature of the equipment and the umbrella coverage.

ORDINANCE NO. 102-19

BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY-SERVICE TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT FOR VARIOUS INSURANCE COVERAGES FOR THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER WITH MCGOWAN & COMPANY, INC. FOR THE YEAR 2020 AT A TOTAL COST OF \$280,000.00

2nd READING

Mr. Shepherd said this coverage is for the city and was bid out in 2018. This is a renewal with McGowan Insurance with an increase of 1.4%.

NEW BUSINESS:

ORDINANCE NO. 97-19

BY: THOMAS J. HUNT

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AMENDING THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, SPECIFICALLY SECTION 331.38 ENTITLED STOPPING FOR SCHOOL BUS; DISCHARGING CHILDREN, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT "A"

1st READING

Mr. Hunt wanted to have a first read on this ordinance. There is still work on the amendment language that needs to be addressed on this ordinance. Mr. Hunt read the code and Reckless Operation is only a minor misdemeanor. Mr. Hunt stated that the amendment as proposed or some determination of a degree of a misdemeanor above a minor misdemeanor may be appropriate. This will be discussed further next week.

ORDINANCE NO. 103-19

BY: DAVID W. FURRY

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN THE CUYAHOGA SOIL AND WATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT AND THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER REGARDING STORM WATER POLLUTION PREVENTION TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, ATTACHED HERETO AS EXHIBIT A

1st READING

Mr. Furry said this is a renewal for Ordinance No. 7-19 that was passed early this year. This will be discussed more at the Committee-of-the Whole Meeting next week.

ORDINANCE NO 104-19**BY: DAVID W. FURRY**

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN THE CUYAHOGA SOIL AND WATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT AND THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER REGARDING STORM WATER POLLUTION EDUCATION, ATTACHED HERETO AS EXHIBIT A
1st READING

This is also a renewal and will be discussed further at next week's Committee-of-the-Whole Meeting next week. This is not a huge line item at \$5500 but since it is with the Cuyahoga Soil and Water Conservation District, the city is providing full disclosure.

ORDINANCE NO. 105-19**BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD**

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE ROCKY RIVER FIRE FIGHTERS ASSOCIATION, LOCAL #659, REPRESENTING THE EMPLOYEES OF THE ROCKY RIVER FIRE DIVISION, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN EXHIBIT "A"
1st READING

This ordinance was just received this evening. This authorizes and ratifies the entering of a collective bargaining agreement with the Rocky River Firefighter's Association. Council has been apprised during negotiations in Executive Session, but this should be discussed in open session next week. Mr. Shepherd asked if this needs to be passed this year. The Mayor said it would be helpful if passed next week to make the 30-day mark. The firefighters have already voted.

ORDINANCE NO. 106-19**BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD**

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE TEAMSTERS LOCAL UNION 436 REPRESENTING CERTAIN EMPLOYEES OF THE ROCKY RIVER WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANT, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN EXHIBIT "A"
1st READING

This is for the Collective Bargaining Unit Teamsters, Local Union 436 that represent the employees at the WWTP. This will be discussed in depth at next week's meeting.

CONSENT AGENDA:**ORDINANCE NO. 83-19****BY: BRIAN J. SINDELAR**

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY-SERVICE TO PURCHASE TIRES ON THE OPEN MARKET AT THE BEST PRICES POSSIBLE FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2020 TO DECEMBER 31, 2020
3rd READING

Mr. Sindelar said this annual ordinance authorizes the administration to purchase tires at the best price possible.

ORDINANCE NO. 84-19**BY: BRIAN J. SINDELAR**

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SAFETY-SERVICE TO PURCHASE GASOLINE, FUEL OIL AND ALLIED PRODUCTS ON THE OPEN MARKET AT THE BEST PRICES POSSIBLE FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2020 TO DECEMBER 31, 2020

3rd READING

Mr. Sindelar said this ordinance authorizes the administration to purchase gasoline, fuel oil and allied products at the best price possible.

RESOLUTION NO. 85-19

BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND SAFETY-SERVICE DIRECTOR TO PARTICIPATE IN THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION COOPERATIVE PURCHASING PROGRAM FOR THE YEARS 2020 THROUGH 2021

3rd READING

This is a bi-annual resolution that authorizes the administration to participate in the Ohio Department of Transportation Cooperative Purchasing Program when it is advantageous to the city. This has been used to purchase salt and vehicles in the past.

ORDINANCE NO. 86-19

BY: MICHAEL O'DONNELL

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE TO PAY THE CITY OF CLEVELAND DIVISION OF WATER A REIMBURSEMENT FOR THE PURNELL AVENUE WATERMAIN REPLACEMENT PROJECT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$59,664.22

3rd READING

Mr. O'Donnell said that this is a refund for money that was paid from the City of Cleveland to the City of Rocky River for the Purnell Watermain Replacement Project. The project came in under the estimated and budgeted amount, so the City of Rocky River needs to refund \$59,664.22 back to the City of Cleveland.

ORDINANCE NO. 87-19

BY: MICHAEL O'DONNELL

AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE TO PAY THE CITY OF CLEVELAND DIVISION OF WATER A REIMBURSEMENT FOR THE LAUREL AVENUE WATERMAIN REPLACEMENT PROJECT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$64,572.05

3rd READING

Mr. O'Donnell said this is for the Watermain Replacement Project on Laurel. This project came in \$64,572.05 under budget. These funds were advanced to the City of Rocky River from the City of Cleveland and this amount needs to be returned to the City of Cleveland.

ORDINANCE NO. 89-19

BY: JOHN B. SHEPHERD

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO CONTRACTS WITH MEDICAL MUTUAL OF OHIO TO PROVIDE HEALTH CARE, PRESCRIPTION INSURANCE COVERAGE, AND OPTIONAL VISION COVERAGE FOR THE FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES OF THE CITY OF ROCKY RIVER, AS FURTHER DESCRIBED IN EXHIBIT "A"

3rd READING

This contract will allow the city to fulfill their obligations under the collective bargaining agreements and also provides important health benefits for full-time employees. There are no substantial reduction in benefits. Prior to being Mayor, Mayor Bobst was involved with the healthcare industry and is very knowledgeable in how to structure this and work things out for the best. The Mayor was able to keep the overall increase at 3.8% and in today's healthcare inflation, that is tremendous.

President Moran moved for passage of the Consent Agenda, Ordinance Nos. 83-19, 84-19, 86-19, 87-19, 89-19 and Resolution No. 85-19 seconded by Mr. O'Donnell.

Vote: Hunt – aye

Shepherd – aye

O'Donnell – aye

Furry – aye

Sindelar – aye
7 ayes

Klym – aye
0 nays

Moran - aye

PASSED

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS: Mr. Klym added in regard to Ordinance Nos. 86-19 and 87-19, he would like to thank Director Thomas, Director Costello and the Mayor in receiving almost \$11 million dollars on the watermain projects from the City of Cleveland. This is not the first time money has been sent back to the City of Cleveland and never has the city asked for more money. This has to do with how successful the city is on these projects year in and year out and is a tremendous credit to the administration. Since 2012 almost \$11 million has been received for approved projects, which is a tremendous assistance to the city. This also shows very good stewards of the funds as the city is using only what it needs.

Mr. Moran concurred with Mr. Klym's statement regarding this decision years ago. This has been a very advantageous situation with huge savings of money that would have come out of the city's budget. The city jumped on this at the right time.

Mr. Furry said the first offer from Cleveland Water was not as good, but the next offer was more advantageous for the city. The waterlines were not assets but liabilities then.

Mr. Shepherd noted that next year the city will be receiving another \$2 million for Story Road and a couple of other projects.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. Ed Nolan, 22607 Meadowhill Lane, Rocky River, thanked the administration for all the infrastructure improvements. Mr. Nolan would like to discuss the Master Plan and the ideas concerning cycling. He has not seen a sign or paint anywhere in Rocky River. The Mayor stated that NOACA is providing a program regarding bicycling and pedestrian Master Plans. This is something Director Costello wanted to do coming out of the city's Master Plan. Rocky River is on the State and National Bike Route. Starting with signage, the city has looked at sharrows but other communities have shared that sharrows work well at first but people begin to ignore them. The Mayor thinks there needs to be a lot of public education about sharing the roads and what that means both for cyclists and motorists. There has been discussion about expanding the sidewalk on the south side of Hilliard by taking the entire tree lawn and making a two way pedestrian and cycling from Westlake to the Metroparks. The issue for Rocky River in striping Hilliard is #1 there is not enough cartway or lane width on Hilliard to do that. #2 Rocky River also allows for parking on Hilliard because there are great distances between the north and south connectors. The city needs to look at other solutions. Parents have given feedback about striping and adults understand what that means, but maybe not children and it could encourage something that is not safe. The Confluence Grant that Director Costello secured for access around the community along with the MetroParks and Lakewood will have some impact, including the section of Hilliard east of Wooster. This is something that is on the administrations mind but it is not happening tomorrow. Putting up signage and sharrows were a part of Detroit Road and the community did not think Detroit Road was the right place for that. The Mayor would love to discuss this further to identify opportunities and where the biking community sees opportunities. The Mayor works a lot with Scott Cowan at Century Cycle. The Bike to School Program is something the city encourages along with bike racks that create an artistic element in the community.

- Councilman Klym encouraged Mr. Nolan to attend the meeting this evening because this is something that is in the Master Plan. There is a two to three page discussion regarding this topic. It is something the Cuyahoga County Planning Commission discusses regarding connections to the Metroparks and here is an opportunity for a citizen who is interested in this topic. Mr. Klym knows there are others because he has had others ask him about bike paths. This may be a chance to continue making the Master Plan a living and breathing document by putting together a committee of residents to discuss this topic.

The Mayor said that stakeholders are needed on the Confluence Grant. If the County receives grant money, they are looking for lakefront access points and have plans for both cyclists and pedestrian. The city was part of the support for that. The Mayor wants the Master Plan to be put in action.

As there was no further business by members of Council, the meeting was adjourned at 8:00 p.m. Mr. Moran reminded Council that next week will be a Committee-of-the-Whole Meeting followed by a Special Meeting.

James W. Moran
President of Council

Susan G. Pease
Clerk of Council